

<p><b>Criteria</b> Literary (A, B, C) Design and Graphics (D, E)</p>	<p><b>Merit (0-70)</b></p>	<p><b>Excellent (71-85)</b></p>	<p><b>Superior (86-100), Nominated for REALM First Class (93-100)</b></p>	<p><b>REALM First Class* (93-100)</b></p>
<p><b>A. Literary Content</b> includes originality, variety, strength of ideas and themes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Effective language, clarity, precision, expressiveness, sophistication, rhythm, musicality.</li> <li>• Masterful use of literary devices (i.e. metaphor, image, symbol).</li> </ul>	<p>Some good writing, but quality may be inconsistent. Variety of contributors clearly limited. Subject matter may lack sophistication or become repetitive at times. (0-38 points)</p>	<p>Good quality writing. Some variety of contributors represented. Sophistication of writing is appropriate to age range of authors. (39-42 points)</p>	<p>Outstanding writing reflecting a variety of contributors. Writing shows skill with form and genre. Compelling subject matter. These pieces stay with readers. (43-50 points)</p>	<p>Outstanding writing reflecting a variety of contributors. Subject matter is surprising and original. Masterful use of literary devices and broad exploration of genres. The work featured is on par with published, professional writing.</p>
<p><b>B. Purposeful Editorial Identity</b> The magazine communicates a strong editorial identity.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It fulfills a specific purpose, as evidenced by its mission statement and editorial choices (i.e. social justice, community need).</li> <li>• Voice of the magazine’s editorial staff is conveyed through purposeful choices of literary and artistic work.</li> <li>• Design and branding communicate magazine identity.</li> </ul>	<p>Editorial vision of the magazine is underdeveloped. Layout, design, and content of the magazine lack cohesive vision.  The magazine’s voice and mission are not evident. (0-10)</p>	<p>Editorial vision of the magazine is clear if less cohesive. Some written and artistic works are suited to this particular magazine’s aesthetics.  The magazine’s voice and mission are unclear. (11-13)</p>	<p>Editorial vision of the magazine is cohesive. Written and artistic works are generally suited to this particular publication’s aesthetics.  The magazine’s voice and mission is clear. (14-15)</p>	<p>Editorial vision of the magazine is strong and noticeably cohesive. Written and artistic works are uniquely suited to this particular publication’s aesthetics.  The magazine’s voice and mission is clear.</p>
<p><b>C. Editing and Proofreading</b></p>	<p>Adequate editing but noticeable errors distract from writing. (0-10 points)</p>	<p>Strong editing. Minimal errors. (11-13 points)</p>	<p>Meticulous editing. Error-free. (14-15 points)</p>	<p>Meticulous editing and proofreading. All writing reads smoothly. The magazine demonstrates a strong attention to detail.</p>
<p><b>D. Unity of Design</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Overall cohesion.</li> <li>• Effective use of art and/or design to complement the writing.</li> <li>• Effective layout and typography.</li> </ul>	<p>Design elements don’t communicate a clear aesthetic identity. Design is cluttered or</p>	<p>Design elements partially communicate a clear aesthetic identity. Design</p>	<p>Design elements communicate a clear aesthetic. Design is clean and intentional.</p>	<p>Design elements communicate a clear and original aesthetic identity. Design is clean,</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Layout, color choices, and font choices provide an ease of reading that showcases the work.</li> <li>● Visual themes reinforced through the intentional use of font families and graphic contrast.</li> </ul>	unintentional. (0-10 points)	shows some elements of intentionality. (11-13 points)	(14-15 points)	intentional, and original.
<b>E. Basics:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Legible and informative front matter (Table of Contents...).</li> <li>● Title page (title, school, city, state, date).</li> <li>● Staff credits, contact information</li> <li>● Colophon included</li> </ul>	Incomplete or lacking information. Table of Contents may be confusing. (0-2 points)	Mostly complete, accurate, and clear. (3-4 points)	Complete, accurate, and well-designed. (5 points)	Complete information, correct pagination. Table of Contents is especially well-designed and fits the aesthetic of the magazine.

**\*REALM FIRST CLASS: Superior magazines may move up to REALM First Class, depending on the national rankings at the annual convention**

Note: This special award (REALM First Class) recognizes magazines that fulfill extraordinary standards of excellence. The magazine is characterized by a variety of genres including print and multimedia presentations, highly original and technically outstanding writing, high-quality design with fonts and graphics that complement the theme and tone, the inclusion of high-quality writings from various disciplines, and other evidence that school-wide participation has gone into the development of the magazine. In such magazines, students handle virtually all aspects of writing, production, and business with exceptional skill. The REALM advisory committee selects this award at the NCTE Annual Convention. The REALM First Class honor may be given to several magazines in a particular year.

adopted by REALM, 4/5/18